

Daf Hashvuah Gemara and Tosfos Beitza Daf 22
By Rabbi Chaim Smulowitz
Tosfos.ecwid.com
Subscribe free or Contact: tosfosproject@gmail.com

Daf 22a

This is R' Huna being consistent to his opinion, as he says; if someone didn't make an Eiruv Tavshilin, he's allowed to bake one loaf of bread, and cook one pot, he can light a candle. R' Yitzchok allows him to roast one fish. We have a Braisa that says the same idea.

Tosfos says that this Gemara implies that you must mention lighting candles when you place the Eiruv Tavshilin. If you didn't mention lighting the candles, we'll only allow you lighting one candle. Since the Gemara here lists it as one of the barebones things that we allow if you don't make an Eiruv Tavshilin, implies we only allow the barebones minimum, i.e., one candle.

Rava answers: really, he placed an Eiruv Tavshilin. The reason Beis Shammai does not let you insulate the water because it's obvious that you're insulating it for Shabbos (and we only allow if people could think you're cooking for Yom Tov). Abaya asked him: we have a Braisa that Chanania said in the name of Beis Shammai that you can't cook for Shabbos unless you have a cooked item for an Eiruv. You can't bake unless you have a baked item for an Eiruv. You can't insulate water if you don't have an insulated water in the Eiruv. So, we see, if you have insulated water for an Eiruv you can insulate for Shabbos even if it's obvious that you're doing it for Shabbos. Rather, Abaya answers: we refer to a case where you made an Eiruv for one thing (cooking) and not for another thing (insulating), and the author is Chanania according to Beis Shammai who doesn't allow insulating in this case.

New Sugya

The Mishna says that Beis Shammai doesn't allow straightening out a candelabra. The Gemara asks: what's wrong with it? R' Chinina b. Bisna answers: we refer to one that has pieces, which looks like building when you assemble it. Beis Shammai forbids it since he holds that the Melacha of building applies to utensils and Beis Hillel allows it since he doesn't hold building applies to utensils.

Tosfos asks: the Gemara in Shabbos says that everyone holds that it's forbidden to assemble a candelabra made from pieces. (So, why do we say here that Beis Hillel permits it?)

Tosfos answers: that Gemara refers to Shabbos where we're more stringent, but on Yom Tov, Beis Hillel permits since there is no real building by utensils.

Alternatively, over there, it refers to a case where it's made from different pieces and each piece was completely detached. Our Gemara refers to a case where it's all attached, but it just needs a slight adjustment to straighten the pieces out.

Ulla visited R' Yehuda. Ulla's attendant pulled back the lamp (in order to draw the oil away from the wick so the flame would go out). R' Yehuda asked Ulla, (how can you allow him to do it?) After all, the Braisa says, if you add oil to a lamp, you're Chayiv for kindling. If you remove oil, you're Chayiv for extinguishing. Ulla says: I hadn't realized it (that the attendant did this, he didn't get his Heter from me).

Tosfos explains: it doesn't mean that you're Chayiv for extinguishing because it goes out earlier, since it's only causing extinguishing, which is permitted on Yom Tov, and he's not Chayiv for

Shabbos, (but it's rabbinically prohibited).

Rather, the reason he's Chayiv is; when he removes oil he makes the flame dim, since the flame can't shine as bright when it has only a little bit of oil in it, so it's considered as you extinguished a little bit of the flame. Therefore, it appears to be extinguishing.

According to this, you can cut a long wax candle on the bottom, since you don't dim the flames at all. Although he causes it to extinguish earlier, it's only causing the extinguishing, which is permitted. However, you may only cut it with fire (to melt the candle in half), but everyone holds you can't cut it with a knife, as we say later that you can only cut a wick with fire, which you would put both sides of the wick in two lamps, and by lighting in the middle, you would make two lighted wicks.

New Sugya

Rav permits 'Kanva' (Rashi- removing the thick charcoal from the head of the wick of a candle to make it burn brighter).

Tosfos asks: later, the Gemara says that it's permitted to be 'Mochet' the wick, which the Gemara explains to remove that charcoal. (If it's the same thing as here), why doesn't the Gemara use the same term as they used there?

Therefore, it seems that there are two types of removing the charcoal. One of them is removing it while the lamp is lit. This is the case brought later. One is when you remove it after the candle went out, (and before you relight it), and this is our Gemara's case. You're removing the charcoal to make it easier to light afterwards.

New Sugya

Abba b. Marta asked Abaya: may someone extinguish a candle on Yom Tov so that he may have relations (which is forbidden to be done in front of a light)? Abaya said that he can move in another house (i.e., another room, that doesn't have a candle). He asked: what if he doesn't have another house to go into? Abaya answered: he can spread linen before the candle and make a Mechitzah. He asked: and what happens if he doesn't have what to make a Mechitzah from? He answered: you can cover the flame with a utensil. He asked: what happens if he doesn't have a utensil to cover the flame? Abaya answered: then, it's forbidden to extinguish it.

The Gemara asks: from a Braisa: you can't extinguish a log in order to save it for later.

Tosfos says: from here we learn that you should protest against women who remove the wick from oil while it's lit and place it on the floor (to become extinguished). The same is true that you shouldn't completely cover a lamp (which will starve it from oxygen and will extinguish it).

Tosfos is bothered: why people light the lamps for the second day Yom Tov, although they don't make sure that it's completely dark? After all, we already explained that (if it's truly still the first day, it's forbidden to do Melacha for the next day), since you can't prepare on one day Yom Tov for the other.

Tosfos answers: even if it's not night yet, still, it's near night (and it's getting dark), and you need the light now (on the first day).

However, you may extinguish it so it shouldn't smoke up your house or your pot. (So, the same should apply to extinguish it to be able to have relations.)

He answered: that Braisa is like R' Yehuda (who permits doing Melacha on Yom Tov to make items that facilitates making foods, like fixing utensils. Since he Darshins "for you" for all your needs, we'll include these needs too.) However, I forbade like the Rabanan who prohibits if it's not for actual food preparation.

Tosfos explains: R' Yehuda permits for all needs, but I hold like the Rabanan.

Tosfos asks: don't we Paskin later like R' Yehuda?

Tosfos answers: we conclude there (despite the Halacha being like him), if someone asks a Shaila, we don't answer to permit it (i.e., we tell people to be more stringent than the Halacha).

Alternatively, we only Paskin like R' Yehuda that the Pasuk "for you" permits only a case where it will facilitate food, but not other needs like allowing relations or not smoking up a pot. (*Maharshah holds like Rosh, although he needs to save the food, extinguishing is not considered a need for food since he can save it by removing it from the fire.*)

Abaya asks Rabbah: if your house is on fire, can you extinguish it on Yom Tov? If there is a possibility that there will be loss of life I never had a question. After all, you would be permitted to extinguish it even on Shabbos. I'm only asking regarding saving his money. Rabbah answered: it's forbidden.

The Gemara asks: from a Braisa: you can't extinguish a log in order to save it for later. However, you may extinguish it so it shouldn't smoke up your house or your pot. (So, the same should apply to extinguishing it to have your house.)

He answered: that Braisa is like R' Yehuda. However, I forbade like the Rabanan who prohibits.

R' Ashi asked Ameimar: can you can apply eye-medicine to eyes on Yom Tov? If there is a threat to life, like certain diseases, there is no question, and of course it's permitted. I refer to the end of the disease (where there is no threat to life) and you're just applying to help the eye sight. He answered: it's prohibited.

The Gemara asks from a Braisa: you can't extinguish a log in order to save it for later, however, you may extinguish it so it shouldn't smoke up your house or your pot. (So, the same should apply to applying eye-medicine.) The Gemara answered the same answer we answered before.

Ameimar permitted to have a non-Jew apply eye medicine to a Jew on Shabbos. Others say that Ameimar himself received this treatment on Shabbos. R' Ashi asked him: what's the base of your Heter? Isn't it what Ulla b. R. Ilay said that you can ask a non-Jew to do anything for the sick on Shabbos? Similarly, R' Hamnuna says, to heal anything that's not life-threatening, you can ask a non-Jew to administrate it. However, R' Ashi concludes; that's only when you don't help administrate the medicine, but here you're helping the application by opening and closing your eyes. Ameimar answers: R' Z'vid already asked me this question, and I answered him that helping is not considered doing anything (since he couldn't do the action himself, only the applier is considered doing it himself, since it wasn't necessary to receive this help).

Ameimar allowed a Jew to administer the eye medicine himself on the second day Yom Tov of Rosh Hashana (like we permit administrating medicine on all second day Yom Tov). R' Ashi asked Ameimar (that the second day of Rosh Hashana is not similar to other second day Yom Tov, but is more stringent.) As Rav says: regarding dead people on Yom Tov, on the first day, only non-Jews may bury them. However, on the

second day, even Jews may bury him even on the second day of Rosh Hashana.

Daf 22b

However, we don't extend that Heter to allow an egg laid on the first day Rosh Hashana to be permitted on the second day.

Ameimar answers: I hold like Nahardai who permitted the egg. After all, the only problem would be if they made Elul an extra day, in which case we would consider the second day Rosh Hashana an extension of the first day. (However, we don't need to worry for that to happen since it's uncommon.) After all, since from the days of Ezra, they never made Elul an extra day.

New Sugya

The Mishna says that Beis Shammai says you can't make thick bread ('Gritzin') on Yom Tov but only wafers. The Gemara brings a Braisa that Beis Shammai says you can't make thick bread ('Avim') on Pesach and Beis Hillel permits. (Assumingly, because we have a concern that a thicker bread will become Chametz.)

The Gemara asks: how thick is considered "thick bread?" R' Huna says a Tefach. After all, we see that the Lechem Hapanim was a Tefach (and it wasn't Chametz). R' Yosef says that you can't bring a proof from there. If they weren't worried about Chametz when you have diligent people working on it in the Mikdash, there's no proof to allow it if worked on by the non-diligent. If we allow it for people who knead the dough thoroughly, it's no proof to allow it by those who don't knead the dough thoroughly. If we allow it where they made sure that the wood is all dry, it's no proof to where the wood may be fresh. If they allow baking in a constantly hot oven, it wouldn't be a proof that we allow baking it in an oven that started out cold. If we allow it in a metal oven it's no proof to allow it in an earthenware oven.

R' Yirmiyah b. Abba said he asked his Rebbi, which was Rav, what is considered by "thick bread" ('Avim'), and he said a large amount of bread. Others say that Rav said he asked his Rebbi, which was Rabbienu Hakadosh, what is considered by "thick bread," and he said a large amount of bread. Why is it called "thick bread?" Because they kneaded a lot, (i.e., the dough was thick). Alternatively, in the town of that Tanna they called a lot of bread "thick bread."

Tosfos quotes Rashi: (the problem is because you're making extra bread than needed for Yom Tov.) Beis Hillel permits because of R' Shimon b. Elazar, that someone can fill up an oven with bread even though you only need one loaf for Yom Tov.

However, Tosfos disagrees. After all, if so, then the Gemara should have brought down R' Shimon b. Elazar, since the argument hinges on his opinion.

Another question: the Mishna talks about a specific thick bread ('Gritzen'). If the Braisa's thick bread ('Avim') is just making extra loaves than necessary, it has nothing to do with our Mishna, so why did the Gemara quote this Braisa by our Mishna?

Therefore, Tosfos explains: "a lot of bread," refers to very large loaves, (that we're afraid that you'll make more) for the weekday, since it doesn't take much effort to make. As the Yerushalmi says, since, (by forcing them to make smaller loaves) you make them put in a lot of effort and they won't be tempted to make more than they need for Yom Tov. After all, making small loaves takes effort to form each individual loaf. According to this, both thick bread and thin bread that the Mishna refers to is only as much as you need, (but for big loaves, we're worried if we allow it for as much as you

need, you'll make extra even what's not necessary for today).

Although the Gemara will say the reason it's forbidden is because you're bothering yourself to make more than necessary, (it doesn't mean that he actually makes more like Rashi's explanation), but rather, we're afraid that, if you'll make large loaves, you'll end up making more than it's necessary for Yom Tov.

The Gemara asks: if so, then the whole problem is because you're putting in extra effort, if so, why did the Tanna say they're arguing about Pesach? He should have said it applies to all Yomim Tovim.

The Gemara answers: it's true it applies to all Yomim Tovim, but the Tanna was teaching the laws of Pesach, so he said this Halacha for Pesach, even though it applies to all Yomim Tovim. We have a Braisa like that: Beis Shammai forbids making thick bread on Yom Tov, and Beis Hillel permits it.

New Sugya

R' Gamliel also was lenient by three things. He allowed sweeping the room (where they ate) by the beds. He also burnt incense on Yom Tov. He also roasted a complete lamb Pesach night like they did by the Korbon Pesach (that the legs and innards were roasted on the side of the body. This was done as a remembrance of the Korbon and he wasn't worried that it will look like he's bringing Kodshim outside the Mikdash.) However, the rabbis forbade all of them.

R' Assi said that the argument is whether you can burn the incense to give smell in clothing (which comes to improve clothing), but all permit it to smell (since it gives pleasure to people).

The Gemara asked from a Braisa. You can't sweep by the beds on Yom Tov. R' Gamliel's household swept. However, R' Eliezer b. Tzadok said that he used to follow his father into R' Gamliel's house, and they didn't sweep on Yom Tov. Rather, they swept Erev Yom Tov, and covered the area with linen (so it wouldn't become dirty again). When guests arrived on Yom Tov, they removed the linen, and the place looked all swept. The rabbis told R' Eliezer b. Tzadok that, if that would be true, it would be permitted on Shabbos (and the Rabanan wouldn't argue with him).

Also, you can't burn incense on Yom Tov, and the household of R' Gamliel did. R' Eliezer b. Tzadok said that he followed his father to their house and they didn't burn incense on Yom Tov. Rather, they burned it Erev Yom Tov in pipes (with holes) and they plugged up the holes for Yom Tov (for the smoke not to escape). When the guests arrived on Yom Tov, they unplugged the holes and the smoke left, and it came out that the room had the smell of incense on Yom Tov. The rabbis told R' Eliezer b. Tzadok that, if that would be true, it would be permitted on Shabbos (and the Rabanan wouldn't argue with him). So, we see that they argue about incense burned to smell.

The Gemara answers: rather, we must say that R' Assi's true statement is: they only argue if you want the incense to smell, but if you burn it to give smell into clothing, everyone holds it's forbidden.

The Gemara inquires: can you smoke fruit over incense on Yom Tov? Rav held it's forbidden. (Although it's for eating, only rich, delicate people appreciate it, but most people don't appreciate it, and you can only do a Melacha for something that's appreciated by all people.) However, Shmuel permits it (since the poor can enjoy it too, although they don't have the opportunity to do so). R' Huna forbade it (like Rav), because when you place the incense on the coals, it partially extinguishes the coals (momentarily). R' Nachman asked: why not say because it's burning the incense on Yom Tov. He answered: (you're right) it starts off extinguishing, and eventually burns.

